

## 4th Meeting of the CMS Multi-Stakeholder Energy Task Force (ETF4)

*Paris, France, 19 – 20 September 2019*

ETF4/Inf.2

### REPORT OF THE 3<sup>rd</sup> MEETING OF THE CMS MULTI-STAKEHOLDER ENERGY TASK FORCE



The Government of the Federal Republic of Germany, through the Federal Ministry for the Environment, Nature Conservation and Nuclear Safety (BMU) were recognized as Champion Plus for their generous support and commitment towards Reconciling Energy Sector Developments with Migratory Species Conservation for the period 2018-2020. The Energy Task Force has been funded with the contribution granted by Germany under the Migratory Species Champion Programme.

Supported by:



based on a decision of the German Bundestag

## 3<sup>rd</sup> Meeting of the CMS Multi-Stakeholder Energy Task Force (ETF3) *Sharm El Sheikh, Egypt, 16 November 2018*

---

ETF3/Report

### MEETING REPORT



The Government of the Federal Republic of Germany, through the Federal Ministry for the Environment, Nature Conservation and Nuclear Safety (BMU) were recognized as Champion Plus for their generous support and commitment towards Reconciling Energy Sector Developments with Migratory Species Conservation for the period 2018-2020. The Energy Task Force has been funded with the contribution granted by Germany under the Migratory Species Champion Programme.

Supported by:



based on a decision of the German Bundestag

## **Agenda Item 1 – Welcoming remarks**

Mr. Tilman Schneider (CMS Secretariat) opened the meeting on behalf of CMS Executive Secretary, Bradnee Chambers, welcoming participants to Sharm El Sheikh, Egypt. Mr. Schneider noted the importance of the Energy Task Force (ETF) to the CMS, and confirmed its support for the programme, its members, observers and the workplan.

Mr. Ashton Berry (BirdLife International), Coordinator of the ETF, introduced himself and informed the participants that no candidate for Chair or Vice-Chair had come forward. He proposed the nomination of Professor Moustafa Fouda (Egypt), to preside over the meeting as Chair for the meeting in the absence of both the incumbent Chair (Constant Hoogstad) and Vice Chair, Mr. James Pearce-Higgins who were unable to attend. The participants approved the arrangements.

Professor Fouda joined Mr. Schneider in welcoming participants and made some introductory remarks. He spoke about the huge numbers of birds impacted by humans, such as by poisoning and other threats. He remembered when he and others initiated work related to migratory birds in Egypt, with the collection of information, and his attendance at his first CMS meeting. Professor Fouda indicated that the Egyptian Government's goal was to generate 20 per cent of its energy from renewable sources by 2020, but in ways that mitigated the risk of collision with wind turbines and electrocution by transmission lines. The Migratory Soaring Birds Project was being implemented by the Egyptian Government's Ministry of Biodiversity, in collaboration with BirdLife International and supported by the UNDP. The projects scope is regional, bringing together a number of countries to work together. At the 2011 CMS COP 10 in Bergen, Professor Fouda discussed birds as a vehicle for mainstreaming biodiversity into development. Mr. Osama El Gebaly had since taken over Professor Fouda's role on the important project.

Professor Fouda concluded his opening remarks by saying that the ETF provided a number of useful case studies that demonstrated what could be achieved, and that he was very happy to be involved with this very important meeting.

## **Agenda Item 2 – Presentation by Ms. Christiane Paulus (Germany)**

Professor Fouda, as Chairperson, welcomed Ms. Christiane Paulus, Deputy Head of Department of Nature Conservation and Sustainable Nature Development, Ministry for Environment, Nature Conservation and Nuclear Safety (BMU), Germany.

In her presentation, Ms. Paulus confirmed the German Governments support of the ETF and talked about the importance of the ETF's multi-stakeholder format in dealing with wildlife issues resulting from renewable energy and energy transmission. Ms. Paulus commented that AEWA had also acknowledged the crucial importance of the ETF. As the demand for energy increased, the need to address climate change and biodiversity conservation became even more urgent. For example, poorly planned renewable energy infrastructure could affect migratory species.

Germany had supported the work of the ETF from the start of the project and would continue to do so until the end of 2020. Germany had decided to move away from nuclear energy with a shift in policy towards relying on safe, renewable energy supplies. However, Ms. Paulus reiterated that biodiversity protection must be taken into account, both for offshore and onshore renewables.

Ms. Paulus discussed the conflicts that might arise between the energy sector and conservationists, but that solutions were possible, such as appropriate spatial planning. The international level of involvement and interest in the ETF was a great acknowledgement of its importance.

Ms. Paulus concluded her remarks by saying that the 3<sup>rd</sup> meeting of the ETF was a very important one, and a great occasion. She wished the meeting and participants good luck for their work.

### **Agenda Item 3 - Tour de table Introduction of participants and adoption of agenda**

Noting the wide range of expertise represented in the ETF, the Chair conducted a tour de table. The list of participants, including those taking part remotely, appears in Annex 2 to this report.

Mr. Schneider (CMS Secretariat), during his introduction, raised the importance of the multi-stakeholder character of the ETF, which was an important benefit and made it dynamic and stimulated ideas and strategies for developing further guidance how to reconcile renewable energy developments and infrastructure with conservation of migratory species. Mr. Schneider said the ETF was very important for CMS as well. The CMS Secretariat was a member and was ready to continue its support to the ETF, and to the COP as the decision-making body of the Convention to continue the work on the appropriate legal framework components relevant to the ETF, such as COP decisions and resolutions.

Mr. Berry introduced the agenda ETF3/Doc.1 and outlined the three objectives for the meeting: 1) Review progress of ETF and CMS Parties to reconcile energy developments with migratory species conservation; 2) Exchange experience, lessons learned and information on ongoing or planned initiatives; 3) Identify priorities for future work of ETF, and opportunities for collaboration. There being no requests for changes, the Chair declared the agenda adopted.

### **Agenda item 4 - Outcomes from CMS COP12 and ETF membership update**

Mr. Schneider presented on the outcomes of the CMS COP12 and a recapitulation of the modus operandi of the ETF, which described the composition and scope of the ETF.

To add support to Mr. Schneider's comments, Mohamed El-Khayat commented on the importance of mainstreaming. The Chair agreed that the CBD COP14 was a very good place for the ETF3 meeting.

Mr. Berry presented an overview on current members and observers. He also detailed plans to engage more with business, industry and the banking sector. The ETF had successfully attracted membership from the government and NGO sectors, but needed to balance this by attracting membership from the business sector.

The Chair asked the meeting for comments or objections:

Miguel Repas, CEO of STRIX Environment and Innovation, stressed his interest in STRIX becoming a member of the ETF. Mr. Repas raised the importance of developers of renewable energy being part of the ETF process as members. He suggested that there was good case for reaching to developers in this regard. Mr. Schneider welcomed the interest of STRIX in ETF membership but reiterated that it was necessary to extend membership in a pragmatic way, and that a decision had been made in the 2<sup>nd</sup> meeting of the ETF that only umbrella organizations would become members. Mr. Berry confirmed this to be the case, and that increased effort to attract industry groups, utility providers and related stakeholders as members and observers would be prioritized.

Professor Mohammad Shobrak, Saudi Wildlife Authority, Saudi Arabia, raised the importance of selecting and prioritizing countries for admission to the ETF that had had success in the safe siting of renewable energy technologies. This would benefit the ETF in providing case studies of successful practice.

Mr. Andrew Dixon from the International Association for Falconry and Conservation of Birds of Prey (IAF) stated his interest in becoming a member due to the international nature of the ETF.

Mr. El-Khayat, New & Renewable Energy Authority (NREA) Egypt, commented on the clear role for the new players from other sectors in the ETF as members and observers.

The Chair emphasized the need to expand the ETF membership to include companies and experts from different field of activity, and the importance of sharing and distributing informational materials amongst the membership.

Mr. El-Gebaly recommended that a stakeholder analysis be considered to ensure we attract and target the most relevant members and observers. The ETF needed members and observers who could benefit it.

Ms. Rivera, from the Ramsar Convention Secretariat, highlighted the importance of being aware and taking advantage of the synergies in national reporting. She suggested that the ETF use the information available from Ramsar and WCMC Reporting. She also asked how the development of best practice case studies were linked to the Scientific Council and similar bodies and how the Guidelines revised. Ms. Rivera also commented that the Ramsar Convention Secretariat should be listed as a member on CMS ETF website.

Mr. Schneider responded on behalf of CMS to questions from Ms. Rivera from Ramsar on National Reporting and review mechanisms for guidelines. CMS was currently in the process of revising its National Reporting Template, as confirmed by the recent 48<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Standing Committee (StC48). The goal of this exercise was to streamline the reporting process to identify and create synergies and reduce the reporting burden.

Regarding Ms. Rivera's second question, Mr. Schneider said that case studies with scientific elements were typically reviewed by the CMS Scientific Council. However, there was no specific mechanism for revising guideline documents. The ETF could request the inclusion of provisions in this respect in the relevant documents submitted to the COP or the StC to bring it to the level of the Scientific Council.

The Chair raised the importance of guidelines, especially when it came to very specific issues (going beyond normal Environmental Impact Assessments (EIAs), such as social issues which could complicate decision-making. Case studies within guidelines were very important to demonstrate the success of activities.

Mr. El-Khayat asked whether the ETF guidelines were required to correspond with international or national legislation. The CMS Secretariat responded that guidelines provided general advice. They could not take into account all specificities of all different national legislations, which could differ among countries. Generally, they needed to be in line with the Convention's provisions and not against international legislation, if adopted under the Convention or other MEAs.

Mr. Repas commented that from the point of view of a practitioner, guidelines were important, but there was often a gap between guidelines and the needs of projects on the ground. Guidelines could be very important tools to inform decisions, but the relevant data were often insufficient. Guidelines should be used as a standard that could be used to identify the level of data required to adequately and accurately assess the potential impact of a wind farm.

Mr. Repas asked if an adequate methodology was in place, what the mechanisms were that could be used to bind developers to best practice and standards and what was expected from wind farms for avoid damage to bird populations.

The Chair commented that the business sector was keen to cooperate and raised the example of proposals for funding to World Bank and other donors.

Mr. El Gebaly commented that there was a possible gap between international and national guidelines. National guidelines are stricter than international guidelines.

The Chair highlighted the need for sharing between Conventions: CMS, Ramsar, CBD, UNFCCC, CITES etc. Mainstreaming had been discussed even before CBD was established when the CMS took the issue up. However, time was running out. The wind industry was growing very fast and not yet considering its impact on biodiversity. The ETF needed to identify funding, raise public awareness and interest and use migratory birds as a vehicle for the sustainable development of renewable energy infrastructure.

### **Agenda item 5 - Summary of Outcomes of the 2nd meeting of the ETF**

Mr. Berry gave a brief summary of key outcomes from ETF2 .The ETF2 meeting report can be found on the dedicated website: <https://www.cms.int/en/meeting/second-meeting-multi-stakeholder-energy-task-force>

### **Agenda item 6 - Workplan and review of action points**

Mr. Berry introduced the new ETF Workplan 2018-2020 and provided a brief summary of the key action points. He outlined attempts by BirdLife International to attract further funds to support another 25 per cent of the ETF funding to support the activities and the personnel.

Mr. Dixon (IAF) asked how the ETF Technical Working Group (TWG) was constituted. Mr. Berry confirmed that it was composed of ETF members and the Coordinator.

Professor Shobrak said that the ETF needed a discussion on TWG to ensure members are selected carefully and circulated. He suggested that TWG should deliver quick responses to technical questions to drive things forward as fast as possible.

The Chair called for a vote of the members to adopt the ETF Workplan 2018-2020. No interventions were received and the Workplan was adopted. If there were any comments, still in the next days, they should be communicated to the Coordinator.

### **Agenda item 7 - Monitoring implementation of ETF Workplan**

#### **7.1 Overview of 2018 work plan activities and report on progress to date**

Mr. Berry referred to each item within the 2018 workplan and detailed the achievements of the ETF to date.

#### **7.2 National case studies, followed by discussion of impediments to implementation**

##### ORÉE presentation:

Ms. Sediri thanked the ETF membership on behalf of Orée for permission to join the ETF as an observer. Ms. Sediri then made a presentation on the Orée 'Biodiversity and economy, circular economy' programme. She highlighted the interdependence between economy/ business and

biodiversity and the importance of considering spatial (in situ, ex situ) and temporal scale (upstream, during operation time, downstream level) in developing environmental plans and decision-making.

Professor Shobrak asked how the ETF could benefit from Orée's involvement in the implementation of the ETF Workplan e.g. analysis of cases from different countries?

Ms. Sediri said that Orée has academic structures that are working on various thematics. Orée can support the ETF with connections to Ministries and break barriers to enhance communication at national levels.

Mr. Berry and Ms. Sediri agreed to continue their communication and to formalize Oree's offer to host the 4<sup>th</sup> meeting of the ETF in Paris.

#### Africa (Renewable Energy in Kenya):

Stephen Manegene, Ministry of Tourism and Wildlife, Kenya, gave a presentation on Kenya's plans and achievements for renewable energy. Kenya currently obtained 69 per cent of its energy demand from biomass and 22 per cent from petroleum. Kenya had large renewable energy development potential and its energy strategy (LCPDP) emphasized geothermal and wind energy.

Sensitivity maps were required for Kenya for birds and bats.

Chris Edeh, African Sustainable Energy Association, commented that there was a considerable amount of renewable energy work to be done in Africa. South Africa's community ownership projects had been successful and should be transferred to other projects/areas.

Professor Shobrak commented that Kenya's presentation shows that there are things on the way and that they would benefit from more support and guidelines. The Chair and Mr. El-Khayat, (NREA), highlighted the information materials that were available in Egypt; for example, on Shutdown on Demand etc; these could be shared with other members. Mr. Repas commented that the materials should be available on their website for others to access.

Mr. Berry commented that the ETF webpage should be used to highlight this information, case studies and success stories. The Chair raised the importance of developing an ETF template that ETF members could use for the description of case studies.

Ms. Elizabeth Ehi-Ebewele, Ministry of Environment, Nigeria, said that there was much interest in Nigeria and that case studies would be welcomed to raise awareness and to disseminate to stakeholders.

#### Mongolia (Powerline impact and mitigation – Saker Falcon):

Mr. Dixon showed a short presentation on the numbers of Saker Falcons impacted by powerlines in Mongolia and the various mitigation measures that the Mohammed bin Zayed Raptor Conservation Fund was employing to reduce the impact.

### **Agenda item 8 - Expanding the scope of the ETF**

A general discussion by members raised the need to expand the ETF membership in order to increase its field of influence. Mr. Berry reported that BirdLife International was working to expand the scope of the ETF into Asia and had made contact with the Asian Development Bank, Swire Pacific Offshore and the Japanese Government. Japan was leading on the development of terrestrial and offshore Sensitivity Mapping and had expressed interest in forming an Asia equivalent of the ETF.

Mr. El-Khayat commented that it was important to develop selection criteria for new members and observers. Mr. Berry suggested adding the creation of the selection criteria to the ETF workplan.

Mr. Berry went on to discuss the scope of the ETF in relation to the types of renewable energy technologies it considers. Currently the ETF focuses on wind and solar energy, but there was scope to include other technologies, such as tidal, wave and the mining of lithium. Mr. Raouf agreed that new technologies should be taken into account as the remit of the CMS covers a range of taxa.

Mr. Schneider detailed the position of CMS on the mining of lithium and the impact it had on flamingo habitats, such as the Ramsar-listed High Andean wetlands. Mr. Schneider highlighted the connection between the High Andean Wetlands Ramsar Regional Initiative and the MOU on the Conservation of High Andean Flamingos and their Habitats as a mechanism for increased synergies under the Ramsar and Bonn Conventions to enhance conservation efforts for both habitats and species. The Ramsar Convention had good contacts within the companies that owned the Ramsar site in Chile.

The Chair agreed that exactly these showcases were needed, constructions and mining need to be addressed; the ETF would be familiar with all conventions, issue of synergy

The Chair emphasized the importance and seriousness of the issue and that, in his opinion, should fall under the remit of the ETF.

Mr. Berry suggested that more funding would be required to take the lithium issue on board and that the ETF needed to look at funding sources.

Melanie Heath, BirdLife International, commented that if members decided to drive this forward, they would also need to extend the geographic scope and membership in this region.

Mr. Dixon suggested that the main guide for the scope of the ETF should be the impact on migratory species, taxa, numbers etc.

Mr. Raouf and Mr. Berry agreed that the ETF needed to be very strong in the direction it went. Professor Shobrak agreed but commented that more information was needed to make a decision. As the ETF had two years of available funding, the membership needed to prioritize its actions.

Mr. El-Gebaly suggested that a priority for the ETF should be at the national and regional level for windfarm projects. Professor Shobrak suggested that a training workshop in Saudi Arabia would also be very useful. The Chair commented that a Centre of Excellency was currently under development in Egypt, and this could serve to coordinate a training workshop in Saudi Arabia.

Mr. Alnouri, Migratory Soaring Birds Project, BirdLife International, and the Chair agreed that avoiding the duplication of processes and models that had already been developed was the most effective and efficient way forward, especially considering short timelines and funding deficiencies. Developing partnerships and cooperation with organizations that already had information or processes was the first step.

Ms. Ehi-Ebewele said that some countries did not have the capacity to develop plans, strategies, information or models. These things should be developed by organizations, such as CMS, and shared with less developed countries.

Mr. Schneider commented that the MOU and workplan of the Ramsar and CMS Secretariats provided a good example of partnership and cooperation. This cooperation was showcased during a side event at the CMS COP12 in 2017. A clear list of mechanisms and information was available, to be incorporated into the Strategic Plan of each convention. The ETF could take advantage of the work already underway in this area by Ramsar and the CMS. There was no need for duplication. Parties were members of both Conventions, and best practices, information and contacts could be shared and show-cased, e.g. contacts with lithium mining. In this way it was important to be ambitious and for Ramsar and CMS to work together on projects to produce concrete outcomes.

## **Agenda item 9 - Promotion and advocacy of ETF**

### **9.1 Responsible Business Forum**

Through its capacity as Coordinators of the CMS ETF, BirdLife International had taken part in the Responsible Business Forum 10-17 October 2018 in Singapore. BirdLife was able to have a significant presence at the Forum with its CEO, Ms. Patricia Zurita, presenting the ETF in a keynote presentation at the forum plenary session, but also at a side event during the week. The ETF was also promoted via discussion with other participants, side meetings and large images of the ETF had been projected on walls around the forum.

Side meetings had been conducted with the Asian Development Bank, Swire Pacific Offshore, DNV GL, the British High Commission for Singapore and PwC.

Two articles had also been completed as a result, of the Responsible Business Forum. Articles are titled:

- How Green Can Green Energy Get ([http://www.responsiblebusiness.com/news/africas-news/how-green-can-green-energy-get/?fbclid=IwAR1m6\\_I-apEcQz6SzXzkbrt7WN4dtCvUWepNhgZ8VJ\\_fSr6cNQ97wY-U6yA](http://www.responsiblebusiness.com/news/africas-news/how-green-can-green-energy-get/?fbclid=IwAR1m6_I-apEcQz6SzXzkbrt7WN4dtCvUWepNhgZ8VJ_fSr6cNQ97wY-U6yA))
- Location, Location, Location (<https://www.birdlife.org/worldwide/news/location-location-location-how-reduce-bird-collisions>)
- Winds of Change - The wind energy industry was roiled by accusations of not being bird-friendly, but fortunately, help was at hand (iMPACT magazine, Edition 27, Jan-Mar 2019, page 18, [www.asianngo.org/magazine](http://www.asianngo.org/magazine)).

### **9.2 Synergies with Conventions e.g. Ramsar COP13, CBD COP14, AEWa MOP7.**

Mr. Noelle Kumpel, Head of Policy, BirdLife International, delivered a presentation on the synergies between Ramsar, CBD, AEWa, CMS and UNFCCC. She spoke of the work BirdLife has undertaken during 2018 to link up and promote these synergies.

## **Agenda item 10 - Stimulating research**

- Mr. James Pearce-Higgins, Director of Science for the British Trust for Ornithology (BTO) and Vice-Chair of the ETF, gave a presentation remotely on the research outcomes of relevance to the 2018 ETF Workplan. Unfortunately, due to technical issues with teleconference facilities, several elements of the stimulating research session could not be completed. However, despite these issues, Mr. Pearce-Higgins was able to make a presentation on the successful completion of research by the BTO on spatial mapping tools that help governments meet their commitments without affecting ecosystems. Results from this research would be published soon.

- Mr. Pearce-Higgins was also able to present the key knowledge gaps that further research was required to fill. Key research gaps included:
  - The accumulative impacts of powerlines and other renewable energy technologies on birds.
  - Analysis of many existing data sets to be undertaken.
  - A gap analysis of existing literature on the impacts of renewable energy technologies, onshore and offshore, on wildlife, including migratory species. (An extensive literature review and database of peer-reviewed and grey literature was being developed by BirdLife International and had the potential to be used for gap analysis purposes).
  - Further research into collision risk models as the current versions are unsuitable for migratory soaring birds. Greater confidence in collision risk models will reduce uncertainty.
  - Research into large-scale accumulative impacts at population scale to gain an accurate picture of total impact.

### **Agenda item 11 – Nomination of Chair and Vice-chair**

The Chair asked the meeting if there were any nominations for Chair and Vice-Chair.

Professor Shobrak formally nominated Osama El-Gebaly as Chair of the ETF for 2019. Mr. El-Gebaly confirmed his availability for the role. Constant Hoogstad, 2018 Chair, also confirmed his availability if nominated, but was happy for someone else to take up the position.

Due to the relatively small number of ETF members present, Mr. Berry said that Mr. El-Gebaly's nomination as Chair of the ETF for 2019 would be circulated and confirmed electronically via email. A deadline of three weeks would be given to submit objections. If there were no objections, the proposal would be adopted and Mr. El-Gebaly would be appointed as the ETF Chair for the term until the next meeting.

### **Agenda item 12 - Recap and discussion: ETF3 Meeting**

The Chair closed the meeting and recapitulated the key points discussed during the meeting. He thanked all participants for their involvement and valued contribution, and then wished them well for 2019.