

# **Convention on the Conservation of Migratory Species of Wild Animals**



1<sup>st</sup> Meeting of the Task Force on Reconciling Selected Energy Sector Developments with Migratory Species Conservation

Cape Town, South Africa, 1-2 December 2016

ETF1/Report

REPORT OF THE MEETING



The Government of the Federal Republic of Germany, through the Federal Ministry for the Environment, Nature Conservation, Building and Nuclear Safety (BMUB) were recognized as Champion Plus for their generous support and commitment towards Reconciling Energy Sector Developments with Migratory Species Conservation for the period 2015-2017. The Energy Task Force has been funded with the contribution granted by Germany under the Migratory Species Champion Programme.



### **Table of Contents**

Acronyms	4
Introduction	5
Main Outcomes (Overview)	5
Agenda Item 1: Welcoming remarks	6
Agenda item 2: Appointment of Chair and Vice Chair, introduction of participants and adoption of the agenda	
Agenda Item 3: Introduction to CMS Resolutions and Guidelines, Terms of Reference and Work Plan	
Agenda Item 4: Terms of Reference and Modus Operandi	7
Agenda Item 5: Case studies	7
Agenda Item 6: Implementation opportunities and challenges	. 11
Agenda Item 7: Information exchange, technical assistance and capacity building	. 11
Agenda Item 8: Input to Work Plan and discussion	. 12
Agenda Item 9: Task Force membership	. 13
Agenda Item 10: Next meeting of the Task Force	. 14
Agenda Item 11: Any other business	. 14
Agenda Item 12: Closure of the meeting	. 14
ANNEX I - Agenda	. 15
ANNEX II - Work Plan 2017-2018	. 18
ANNEX III - Cape Town Declaration	. 22
ANNEX IV - List of Participants	

#### Acronyms

AEWA Agreement on the Conservation of African-Eurasian Migratory

Waterbirds

AfDB African Development Bank

AFSEA The African Sustainable Energy Association
BMUB The Federal Environment Ministry of Germany

BTO British Trust for Ornithology

CCI Cambridge Conservation Initiative

CMS Convention on the Conservation of Migratory Species of Wild Animals

EBRD The European Bank for Reconstruction and Development

EIA Environmental Impact Assessment

EIB European Investment Bank

ENTSO-E The European Network of Transmission System Operators

ETF Energy Task Force

EWEA European Wind Energy Association

EWT Endangered Wildlife Trust

IBA Important Bird Area

IFC International Finance Corporation

IUCN International Union for Conservation of Nature

MoU Memorandum of Understanding

MSB Migratory Soaring Birds

NGO Non-Governmental Organisation RGI The Renewables Grid Initiative

SEA Strategic Environmental Assessment

ToR Terms of Reference

USAID United States Agency for International Development

#### Introduction

- The Multi-stakeholder Task Force on Reconciling Selected Energy Sector Developments with Migratory Species Conservation ('Energy Task Force'), established by Resolution 11.27 of the Convention on the Conservation of Migratory Species of Wild Animals (CMS), met for the first time in Cape Town, South Africa, from 1-2 December 2016.
- 2. The meeting was attended by the following Members: CMS Secretariat, South Africa, Egypt, Israel, Germany, Kenya, Ghana, Power Africa United States Agency for International Development (USAID), Endangered Wildlife Trust (EWT), BirdLife International, the Renewables Grid Initiative (RGI), the European Bank for Reconstruction and Development (EBRD) and by the two observers BirdLife South Africa and British Trust for Ornithology (BTO).<sup>1</sup>

#### **Main Outcomes**

- 3. The Energy Task Force (ETF) took a number of decisions to seek to enable its proper functioning and the effective implementation of its mandate:
  - a. It agreed on the procedures for the future work of the task force (**Modus Operandi**) and on the **procedure for the admission of new members and observers.**
  - b. It developed and agreed on an extensive Work Plan for 2017-2018 (Annex II) including a detailed Outreach Plan. The Work Plan sets out in detail the priority actions through which the Energy Task Force intends to implement its mandate/terms of reference in the years 2017-2018 and determines those members taking the lead on each activity.
  - c. It developed and agreed on the ETF's **Cape Town Declaration** (Annex III) which serves as a tool to inform key players about the objectives and the approach taken by the ETF in addition to existing CMS and AEWA Guidelines.<sup>2</sup>
- 4. The Energy Task Force has started the implementation of its mandate through:
  - a. **Exchange of information, experience, good practice** and know how on the basis of **several case studies** presented at the meeting (para. 5.5. of its Terms of Reference (ToRs)<sup>3</sup>; see paras. 15-31 of this report).
  - b. The identification of **research gaps** as part of the process to stimulate more research (para. 5.7 ToRs; see paras. 17-18 of this report).
  - c. Discussion of the usefulness of and **gaps in relevant guidelines**, as part of the process to identify existing impediments for adequate implementation of guidelines (para. 5.4 ToRs; see paras. 32-34 of this report).
- 5. Based on the case studies (Agenda Item 5) and the session on implementation challenges and opportunities (Agenda Item 6), the Energy Task Force identified the following strategic interventions as a matter of priority:

<sup>1</sup> Renewables Grid Initiative, European Bank for Reconstruction and Development and British Trust for Ornithology participated through remote participation.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> "Guidelines on How to Avoid or Mitigate the Impact of Electricity Power Grids on Migratory Birds in the African-Eurasian Region", adopted by CMS COP10, AEWA MOP5 and CMS Raptors MOU MOS1; 'Renewable Energy Technologies and Migratory Species: Guidelines for Sustainable Deployment', adopted by CMS COP11 and AEWA MOP6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> The Terms of Reference for the Energy Task Force are set out in the Annex to CMS Resolution 11.27.

- a. Addressing research/gaps in knowledge: The Energy Task Force has identified and learned from ongoing research projects relevant for decision makers. However, gaps in knowledge have also been identified and must be addressed. The ETF will promote research into the current and predicted impacts of renewable energy and power line development on migratory species, the effectiveness of avoidance and mitigation measures, and related economic costs and benefits as a matter of priority.
- b. Promoting and improving guidance material: The ETF will support the implementation of existing CMS Guidelines, for instance by preparing and disseminating tailored information resources for the energy sector, policy makers, regulators, financial institutions and conservation organisations. It will also identify gaps in existing guidance material, e.g. regarding impact thresholds, and endeavor to develop additional guidance to fill those gaps.
- c. **Exchange of best practices**: The ETF will be a forum which identifies best practices both with regards to procedural aspects (e.g. how to stimulate dialogue between energy companies and NGOs, environment and energy ministries) and measures to mitigate impacts (e.g. shut down on demand; design of power lines).
- d. Outreach: The ETF will facilitate collaborative engagement between key stakeholders, focused on identifying and implementing practical, evidence-based strategies for reducing the impacts of energy development on migratory species. The meeting highlighted that effective integration of wildlife conservation into energy policy and decision making can contribute to public acceptance of renewable energy development and reduce the potential for conflict, delay and associated financial costs.

#### Agenda Item 1: Welcoming remarks.

6. Mr. Marco Barbieri from the CMS Secretariat opened the meeting, also on behalf of AEWA who was unable to attend. He thanked BirdLife International and BirdLife South Africa for their work to organize the meeting, the Government of South Africa for their support and the Government of Germany (BMUB) for the financial support to the meeting and the activities of the Energy Task Force. Mr. Pepe Clarke from BirdLife International also welcomed participants on behalf of BirdLife International and the Coordinator of the ETF, Ms. Aida Kowalska. He summarized BirdLife International's main initiatives of relevance to the ETF. Ms. Wilma Lutsch of South Africa welcomed participants on behalf of the Ministry of Environment of the Government of South Africa.

## Agenda item 2: Appointment of Chair and Vice Chair, introduction of participants and adoption of the agenda.

- 7. On the proposal of the CMS Secretariat, who had undertaken preliminary informal consultations with the ETF, the meeting appointed Mr. Jürgen Friedrich (Germany) as Chairperson and Ms. Wilma Lutsch (South Africa) as Vice-Chairperson for the meeting and the subsequent intersessional period until the next meeting of the ETF.
- 8. The meeting proceeded with a self-introduction of the participants. A list of participants is appended to this report as Annex IV. Information on the criteria and approaches that led to the initial membership of the Energy Task Force can be found in the section concerning agenda Item 9 (paras. 45-55 of this report)
- 9. The Provisional Agenda and Meeting Schedule contained in Annex I was proposed to the meeting for consideration and adoption. The agenda was adopted with a revision of the schedule, consisting of moving the discussion of the Modus Operandi (item 5) together with the Terms of Reference of the ETF (item 3). It was also proposed and agreed to develop a Cape Town Declaration as one of the outputs of the meeting, with the main objective to inform key players about the objectives and approaches of the ETF. To this effect, a drafting group [composed of the chairperson, the vice-chairperson and representatives of BirdLife

International and the CMS Secretariat] was set up with the task of preparing a draft Declaration for participants' consideration toward the end of the meeting.

#### Agenda Item 3: Introduction to CMS Resolutions and Guidelines, and Work Plan

- 10. The CMS Secretariat presented the relevant Resolutions and Guidelines adopted in the framework of CMS and AEWA, summarizing the process that had led to their development. All documents were part of the documentation for the meeting as documents ETF1/Inf.1 to Inf.7.
- 11. BirdLife International gave a brief presentation of the draft Work Plan for the Energy Task Force 2017-2018, contained in document ETF1/Doc.3. The draft provided a proposed template and a certain number of suggestions for possible activities, to be further developed and enlarged during the meeting.

#### Agenda Item 4: Terms of Reference and Modus Operandi

- 12. The CMS Secretariat presented the draft Modus Operandi contained in document ETF1/Doc.2. The Terms of Reference for the ETF contained in CMS Res.11.27 had been taken as the basis for the Modus Operandi, which expanded on areas not covered by the Terms of Reference.
- 13. Following discussion, the Modus Operandi was agreed with the following additions and clarifications:
  - As of the second meeting of the ETF, candidates for the position of chairperson and vicechairperson will be identified through a process of self-nomination, to take place in advance of the meeting and to be coordinated by the Task Force Coordinator; a decision on the appointment will be made by ETF members at the meeting on the basis of the nominations received.
  - For all matters not explicitly covered by the Modus Operandi, the Rules of Procedure for the meetings of the Conference of the Parties to CMS will apply *mutatis mutandis*.
- 14. An additional issue that emerged during the debate was how to address voting rights of members participating remotely in ETF meetings. The ETF felt that voting rights should only be exercised by those that are present at the meeting. The ETF Members participating remotely would be considered as observers during the voting procedures. While all members of the ETF accepted this principle, it was also stressed that there the aim should be to allow the possibility for all members to attend in person, and to take this into account when selecting meeting venues, notably in relation to the issuance of visas. The issue will be finalized at the next meeting.

#### Agenda Item 5: Case studies

15. The Case Study session consisted of a series of presentations followed by discussion, aimed *inter alia* at setting the framework for deliberation on the future work plan activities of the task force. The case study presentations included topics on legislation and policy, strategic planning and impact assessments, mitigation measures and cooperation with the energy industry. The PDFs of the PPT presentations are made available for downloading from the <a href="ETF">ETF meeting webpage</a>.

- 16. The first case study was presented by Dr James Pearce-Higgins (BTO). Dr Pearce-Higgins introduced the Cambridge Conservation Initiative's (CCI) project that assessed impacts of different levels of renewable energy generation for birds and mammals globally<sup>4</sup>. The CCI is a unique collaboration between the University of Cambridge and internationally-focused biodiversity conservation organisations based in Cambridge, UK. The CCI partners together combine and integrate research, education, policy and practice to create innovative solutions for society and to foster conservation learning and leadership.
- 17. Discussion: The ETF raised questions with regards to the application of the models to impacts of existing renewable energy infrastructure projects, notably whether the models would be applicable to power line infrastructures, in particular to off grid power lines. The ETF raised further questions with regards to the availability of bird collision data and whether modelling may include additional effects of specific renewable energy technologies during the migration period. Dr Pearce-Higgins explained that further data collection and modelling would have to be conducted to cover power lines, to include additional renewable energy technologies such as bioenergy and to expand to various taxonomic groups. Dr Pearce-Higgins explained that detailed species information is made available through the IUCN species information page and the modelling may provide details on assessments for certain species, depending on the available information.
- 18. **Conclusion**: The ETF concluded that different renewable energies and geographies may cause different impacts and mortalities to species and that there is a clear evidence gap which requires further studies on collision rates and other mortalities. The ETF felt that the CCI project is a valuable study that may provide an understanding of species mortalities of windfarms, in particular how renewable energy could be deployed in order to minimize its effects. The ETF requested therefore that the CCI project communicates its results to the ETF once completed. The results of the study could be interpreted into languages that would be meaningful for different stakeholders such as governments. The ETF also agreed to provide further feedback to the CCI project intersessionally and to share the study under the activities of the ETF. Dr Pearce-Higgins offered to engage further with the ETF to inform the next steps for the CCI research paper and adapt the paper for relevance to national decision making.
- 19. Ms. Stephanie Bätjer from the Renewables Grid Initiative (RGI) presented RGI's approach to establishing partnerships between transmission system operators (TSO) and civil society. RGI connects TSOs and relevant civil society organisations across Europe, but also aims at establishing partnerships on national level. The partnerships include early collaboration in the grid development phase where risks are addressed and concerns are raised by civil society. This approach ideally increases public acceptance for power grid development. A particularly successful initiative, that also has great relevance for the task force, is RGI's "Good Practice of the Year Award". In 2014, for example, BirdLife's "Preventing electrocution of endangered birds" project won the award in the "environmental protection" category.
- 20. Discussion: The ETF raised questions on how RGI would envision their support in promoting their best practices in the future through the ETF. Ms Bätjer proposed that RGI could identify where best practices are found in every step of grid development and communicate and promote these in Europe and beyond. Ms Bätjer noted that there may be constraints in providing any further support due to the lack in resources to actively communicate, collect, and share best practices globally as this may require a full time dedicated person. The ETF also enquired whether RGI works on underground electricity cables and whether there is any legislation in existence on new transmission infrastructure irrespective of whether the source is renewable energy or fossil fuel energy. Ms Bätjer explained that underground infrastructure tends to be expensive and environmentally invasive, however it can definitely be a solution when grids have to cross frequented bird migration routes. It is one of the topics that are part of RGI's expertise portfolio and RGI will organise an underground cable workshop together

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> The recorded video presentation and details on the project can be found on the <u>CCI project website</u>.

with German TSO Amprion shortly. Ms Bätjer continued to explain that the different members of the European Union have different legislation on underground power lines, Germany for example recently passed a law establishing that all future high-voltage DC lines shall be build underground if technically feasible. The ETF enquired about how RGI ensures that TSOs apply guidelines and how they overcome the industry resistance to collaborate or comply. Specifically, the ETF enquired which approach RGI takes in engaging TSOs, whether through economic, regulatory or advocacy pressure. Ms Bätjer explained that there are clear economic reasons for TSOs to collaborate, TSOs are aware that public acceptance and regulatory compliance is necessary to avoid public resistance which may be costly if not addressed. RGI is increasingly working on institutionalizing the process of applying guidelines by TSOs and RGI has a large database of 130 best practices that can be filtered by TSOs to either be applied for environmental practices or increasing public acceptance of development projects. Ms Bätjer offered to share further information about RGI's work with the ETF, in particular good practice projects that have already been implemented<sup>5</sup>.

- 21. **Conclusion**: The task force concluded to continue working closely with RGI on finding ways to share best practices identified by RGI and the group in and beyond Europe, resources permitting. The ETF identified RGI's approach as a best practice and RGI offered to share their best practice in establishing partnership with TSOs and civil society.
- 22. Mr Pepe Clarke from BirdLife International gave a presentation on the Migratory Soaring Birds (MSB) Sensitivity Mapping Tool, a decision support tool developed by Birdlife to assist wind energy developers and regulatory authorities to identify avian collision risks of proposed wind energy developments in the Rift Valley/Red Sea flyway. The tool has recently been expanded to cover the Mediterranean region.
- 23. **Discussion:** The ETF inquired about the data used to inform the tool. Mr Clarke explained that the tool uses georeferenced records of soaring birds (83 species) from across the region. The principal source of these is the Important Bird Areas (IBA) database. Additional soaring bird records have been collated from a range of literature sources and data archives. Contextual information is provided through satellite tracking data and species' range maps, and the tool contains spatial data on protected areas and topography. He explained that the data underpinning the tool may be incomplete or out of date in some instances. Data will be continually improved; however the observation points are not updated regularly as this depends largely on the Important Bird Area's (IBA) monitoring programme and the available resources of a country.
- 24. **Conclusion:** The expanded MSB tool is now available for all stakeholders to access. The ETF agreed that the tool has useful applications in the early stages of selecting a location for building infrastructure developments. There was an interest by the ETF to engage with BirdLife International and learn further about the new tool and to provide national ornithological data to input to the tool where needed.
- 25. The following presentations focused on national examples of best practices, from South Africa and Egypt. Presentations from Egypt were given by Dr Mohammed El-Khayat, (New & Renewable Energy Authority) and Mr. Osama Elgebaly (Egyptian Ministry of Environment). They shared their experience on strategic planning for energy deployments, highlighted the importance of the Migratory Soaring Birds project and supported the use of the BirdLife International avian sensitivity mapping tool.
- 26. **Discussion:** The ETF discussed the role of funding and to which extent funders create obligations for impact assessments and how shut down on demand works. The ETF raised various questions with regards to how cumulative impacts will be assessed and information shared between investors and for instance the BirdLife partner in Egypt. There were

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> See the Renewable Grid Initiative database of best practices: <a href="http://renewables-grid.eu/activities/best-practices.html">http://renewables-grid.eu/activities/best-practices.html</a>.

questions about whether central monitoring systems would be in place and whether companies will be able to develop their own system such as use of DTBIRD (visual system for turbine shut down). Dr El-Khayat and Mr. Elgebaly explained that Radar-assisted shut down on demand informs the presence of birds with more than 50 birds of a species that can be made part of a criteria. There are different conditions on the maintenance of turbines in various countries e.g. in Egypt the turbines have to run for a certain number of hours. The DTBIRD is effective for birds that are identified far from wind turbines, not more than 500m. This lowers the lifespan of a turbine because the operator would not have the time to shut down a wind turbine smoothly that is located in a closer proximity whereas radar-assisted shut down can cover larger areas. Mr. Clarke noted the cost breakdown of shut down on demand that can be found in the MSB project documents<sup>6</sup>. BirdLife South Africa noted that South Africa has different mitigation solutions to their species of birds compared to the Red Sea/Rift Valley flyway countries that have a large amount of migratory soaring birds and would require shut down on demand.

- 27. **Conclusion**: The ETF commended the Egyptian example, also for the way in which energy and environment departments of the governments work together. On a request by the ETF the presenters agreed that they can share further information on their best practices and experiences through the ETF.
- 28. Insights from South Africa were shared though presentations from Ms. Samantha Ralston-Paton (BirdLife South Africa) and Mr. Constant Hoogstad (Endangered Wildlife Trust (EWT). Mr. Hoogstad shared case studies on power line planning mortalities, interactions and impacts in South Africa, and noted the successful strategic partnership between the EWT and Eskom (power utility in South Africa). He also emphasised that utilities must realise that wildlife mortalities also have an impact on the quality of supply and directly influencing their revenue generation. If industry understands that pro and re-active mitigation of energy infrastructure has both a business and environmental case it makes it much easier to motivate for mitigation. Ms. Ralston-Paton presented case studies to highlight the value of applying appropriate EIA procedures and of undertaking appropriate surveys and monitoring before and after deployment for wind energy projects (as per CMS Resolution 11.27). She noted the critical importance of information exchange for understanding cumulative impacts, and that data collection is often necessary if strategic environmental assessments are to be of value. Ms. Ralston-Paton emphasized that the issues and needs of local birds in South Africa will differ from those in, for example, North Africa countries of the Red Sea/Rift Valley Flyway that will emphasize migratory soaring birds. The role of the ETF would benefit from understanding national circumstances and to expand the scope of ETF's work to include species that rarely migrate as of equal importance. Ms. Ralston-Paton further emphasized that pre-construction monitoring should be made part of the EIA process (the data is required to guide the mitigation strategy). It is as important to ensure that bird specialists carrying out the impact assessment and monitoring have the necessary skills and expertise.
- 29. **Discussion**: The ETF inquired whether CMS had any intentions to include utilities companies in the ETF. Mr. Barbieri clarified that power grids are included in CMS guidelines and that the goal of the ETF membership is to expand it to include utilities as key players.
- 30. Conclusion: The ETF emphasized that monitoring is generally lacking or of poor quality. The ETF felt that it should be an important priority of the ETF to address monitoring challenges by encouraging monitoring actions where it is missing and transparency through stakeholder participation and third party monitoring. The ETF further highlighted the importance of understanding and communicating economic benefits to the energy industry relating to avoiding impacts on migratory species. The members Power Africa and EWT proposed that

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> See pp.27-29 for costs of <u>Shutdown on Demand.</u> (Review and guidance on use of "shutdown-on-demand" for wind turbines to conserve migrating soaring birds in the Rift Valley/Red Sea Flyway; by GEF, UNDP and BirdLife International, 2015)

they could draw from relevant expertise to construct narratives about the reduction of costs associated to loss of electricity and damage to power line infrastructure by designing appropriate mitigation measures.

#### Agenda Item 6: Implementation opportunities and challenges

- 31. The morning of the 2<sup>nd</sup> day of the meeting was facilitated by BirdLife International, and focused on opportunities and challenges related to the implementation of relevant Resolutions and CMS Guidelines, including national legislation, strategic planning impact assessment and operational procedures, financial institutions and energy sector policy and practice. Three breakout groups addressed the following three topics: (a) key changes that would need to take place to policy and practice, (b) identification of key barriers, and (c) identification of strategic actions that could be taken by the Energy Task Force. The main results from the work of the break out groups and discussion in plenary raised are synthesized in the paragraphs below, and informed the further development of the ETF Work Plan (Annex II).
- 32. Changes to policy and practice. The ETF, based on the work by the break out groups, identified the following main policy changes as desirable in order to enable adequate safeguards for migratory species: improvements in the legislative framework; the development of national monitoring protocols; and the incorporation of Cumulative Impacts Assessments, as well as Environmental Impact Assessments (EIA) and Strategic Environmental Assessments (SEA) requirements in national legislation. It was noted that the identification and implementation of mitigation measures would differ depending on whether new or already existing energy infrastructure are considered, and that it would generally be preferable and less costly to provide for mitigation measures from the outset rather than fixing problems after construction has been completed. It was acknowledged that there are challenges in identifying and proposing best practices on monitoring protocols because the policy frameworks and monitoring needs will differ in each country. A range of stakeholders could participate in the design and implementation of monitoring protocols, possibly through the development of MOUs among relevant institutions and organizations.
- 33. <u>Barriers to policy implementation</u>. The ETF discussed the lack of communication between stakeholders and the various reasons behind communication barriers, such as; the risk to share sensitive monitoring information and a lack of understanding of how environmental risks could become business risks. In this regard, there is a lack of understanding of the economic arguments supporting best practices on mitigating impacts on migratory species. The ETF further noted that there is insufficient information and data sharing on bird impacts among stakeholders, and a lack of integrated monitoring that is further hindered by non-disclosure agreements amongst developers. The ETF further elaborated that the lack of training and skill development may also constitute an obstacle to the practical implementations of best practices.
- 34. <u>Strategic Action by the ETF.</u> The ETF raised a number of suggestions, such as; promoting the standardization of science-based protocols; encouraging information and data gathering and exchange amongst different stakeholders; updating, promoting and implementing CMS Guidelines; developing economic arguments in support of best practices and addressing communication barriers between environmental and business communities; and engaging with relevant stakeholders such as governmental energy departments, finance institutions, the private sector, the conservation community, and academics.

#### Agenda Item 7: Information exchange, technical assistance and capacity building

35. BirdLife International introduced document ETF1/Doc.5, which provided a brief description of the Energy Task Force webpages, provisionally hosted within the CMS website, and a

proposal for the development of an internal online workspace. The meeting was invited to provide feedback on i) the structure of the public part of the website; ii) whether the current interim arrangement for the hosting of the website was to be maintained, or a different option was preferred; iii) the proposed functionalities of the internal work space and possible recommendations on the development of the tool.

- 36. **Discussion**: The ETF discussed the need for an internal workspace to fulfil the communication needs of the ETF, with different views expressed. The ETF raised the need to avoid complicated paths to access communications and the possibility to edit documents online in particular.
- 37. **Decision**: The ETF approved the website in its current form. Any future feedback on the webpage would be sent to the Coordinator by email. The ETF approved the establishment of an internal online work space, drawing on the previous experience and advice of the CMS Secretariat. The Coordinator will follow up with the CMS Secretariat communications and IT team on the possibility of editing a live document by multiple users within the workspaces it could develop.

#### Agenda Item 8: Input to Work Plan and discussion

- 38. BirdLife International facilitated the review of the draft Work Plan 2017-2018 contained in document ETF1/Doc.3. Additional activities that had emerged notably from the discussion on opportunities and challenges had been added. It was also decided to merge the Work Plan with the Outreach and Promotion Plan document included in document ETF1/Doc.4.
- 39. The ETF was invited to consider the activities proposed and to suggest amendments and new activities. In relation to the duration of the Work Plan, it was noted that funding to support ETF coordination was secured only until the end of 2017. Therefore activities to be undertaken in 2018 under the lead of the coordinator are subject to the identification of financial and/or human resources to support coordination functions.
- 40. **Discussion:** The ETF discussed the importance of developing and reviewing guidelines on the basis of sound scientific data. A platform was envisaged where governments could provide data on the impacts of migratory species of renewable energy and power lines. Further discussion highlighted the need for the development of sensitivity mapping and for ensuring survey quality, by involving various stakeholders such as academics in the process. The ETF discussed the possibility of establishing a forum for scientists to provide input on the methodology for developing sensitivity maps.
- 41. **Decisions**: The ETF approved the Work Plan with various additions and assigned leads for carrying out the activities listed in the Work Plan (Annex II).
- 42. A **Technical Working Group** was established within the ETF with the task to carry out a selected number of activities, including
  - To identify key **research priorities** and communicate these to the Energy Task Force and to inform future engagement with research institutions
  - To review existing guidance material to identify gaps, and prepare a series of technical notes to accompany the existing CMS/AEWA guidelines if needed
  - To convene a process to review and compare existing **sensitivity mapping tools**, and provide recommendations on these to the Energy Task Force

The representative of Israel (Noam Leader) was appointed as the Chairperson for the working group.

43. The final version of the Work Plan 2017-2018 is appended to this report as Annex II.

#### Agenda Item 9: Task Force membership

- 44. The CMS Secretariat introduced this item by summarizing the process that had led to the current membership of the ETF. An advisory group had assisted the CMS Secretariat in identifying potential members in the various categories of stakeholders. The meeting was invited to consider the need for strengthening the membership and to provide guidance as appropriate.
- 45. Countries to be invited to become members of the ETF had been identified among CMS and AEWA Parties in the African Eurasian region on the basis of their actual and/or planned wind capacity and power grid network and avian sensitivity, and considering geographic balance. Of the 13 countries invited, nine had accepted the invitation. Of these, only Egypt had nominated representatives from both the Environment and Energy departments of the Government, as suggested by the invitation. Four countries (Ethiopia, Morocco, Saudi Arabia, and Spain) had either abstained from nominating a representative for the time being, or did not reply.
- 46. **Decision**. It was agreed that the CMS Secretariat will contact again the four countries that had not accepted the invitation yet as soon as the outputs of the meeting will be finalized. Within the governments of countries already members, representatives of the environment department will liaise with the energy department as appropriate with a view to assessing their interest in designating representatives in the ETF.
- 47. Among the Secretariats of relevant MEAs identified by Res. 11.27, only the CMS and AEWA Secretariats are currently members. The Secretariats of the Ramsar and Bern Conventions had been invited and were considering joining.
- 48. **Decision.** The ETF agreed to continue liaising with the Bern and Ramsar Secretariats on the question of their membership. It was also agreed to seek the formal involvement of the Eurobats Secretariat.
- 49. A few multilateral development banks and donor agencies known to be supporting energy infrastructure projects had been invited to join the ETF. Of these only the European Bank of Reconstruction and Development (EBRD) and USAID Power Africa had accepted the invitation. The International Finance Corporation (IFC) had declined the invitation due to lack of capacity, while the European Investment Bank (EIB), the African Development Bank (AfDB) and the World Bank (WB) were considering becoming members, and were in contact with BirdLife International in this regard.
- 50. **Decision**. The ETF agreed to continue liaising with the EIB, AfDB and WB on the question of their membership.
- 51. No representative of the private sector had yet been invited, as no clear orientation on the criteria to select candidate members had emerged. It had been agreed to seek guidance from the ETF at its first meeting on how to proceed. The ETF discussed the best approach to engage with the private sector,
- 52. **Decision.** The ETF agreed to pursue the membership of representative energy associations, in the hope that this will allow to reach and engage a large number of energy companies. The ETF identified the European Wind Energy Association (EWEA), the African Sustainable Energy Association (AFSEA) and the European Network of Transmission System Operators (ENTSO-E) as potential candidates. The CMS Secretariat agreed to verify their interest in joining the ETF and prepare proposals in line with the procedure for the acceptance of new members defined by the *Modus Operandi*.

- 53. The ETF emphasized the desire of expanding the membership of relevant civil society organizations and mentioned IUCN, the British Trust for Ornithology (BTO) and the BirdLife partners in Egypt, Kenya and South Africa in particular.
- 54. **Decision.** The Chair encouraged the submission of proposals for new members in line with the *Modus Operandi*. The ETF decided that national chapter organizations of international organizations that are already members of the ETF would be eligible to become observers of the ETF, such as the national partners of BirdLife International. The ETF also agreed that BirdLife Kenya, Egypt and South Africa are admitted as observers of the ETF.

#### Agenda Item 10: Next meeting of the Task Force

55. Following discussion, including consideration of resource availability, it was agreed that the second meeting of the Energy Task Force should take place in Bonn, Germany, preferably during the first half of September 2017. The CMS Secretariat agreed to verify the availability of facilities for the meeting at the UN Campus in Bonn, and to respond with a proposal to ETF as soon as possible.

#### Agenda Item 11: Any other business

56. A draft Cape Town Declaration on reconciling renewable energy and power line development with migratory species conservation was tabled for consideration of the ETF by the drafting group established at the outset of the meeting by the Chair. Following discussion, the Declaration was adopted with some further changes as it appears in Annex III to this report.

#### Agenda Item 12: Closure of the meeting

- 57. The Chairperson welcomed the engagement of the ETF over the course of the two-day meeting and summarized the results of the meeting. He emphasised that the ETF took off in a promising manner and that from now on, it depends on the dedication of its members whether it will be successful. In his view the challenges are great but the ETF can make an impact through strategic interventions (compare para. 5 of this report).
- 58. The Chairperson closed the meeting at 19:30 on Friday 2 December.

## ANNEX I PROVISIONAL ANNOTATED AGENDA AND MEETING SCHEDULE

Time	Mode	Activity/Agenda Item	Speakers/Facilitators	Documents	Notes
THURSDAY 1 I	December 2	2016			
0800 – 0930		Registration for Energy Task Force meeting			
0930 – 1230	Plenary	Agenda Items 1: Welcoming remarks	Marco Barbieri, CMS Pepe Clarke, BirdLife Int. Wilma Lutsch, South Africa		Representatives from the CMS Secretariat, BirdLife International and the Government of South Africa will welcome participants with introductory remarks.
		Agenda Item 2: Appointment of Chair and Vice Chair, introduction of participants and adoption of the agenda.	Marco Barbieri, CMS	ETF1/Doc.1	The Secretariat will invite members to appoint a Chair and Vice-Chair for the meeting and for the intersessional period until the next Task Force meeting. Once appointed, the Chair will invite participants to introduce themselves and will introduce the Provisional Annotated Agenda and Meeting Schedule for adoption.
		Agenda Item 3: Introduction to CMS Resolutions and Guidelines, and Work Plan	Marco Barbieri, CMS Pepe Clarke, BirdLife Int.	ETF1/Doc.3 ETF1/Inf.1 ETF1/Inf.2 ETF1/Inf.3 ETF1/Inf.4 ETF1/Inf.5 ETF1/Inf.6	The CMS Secretariat will present relevant Resolutions and CMS Guidelines. This will be followed by a discussion on the Terms of Reference for the Task Force, an initial discussion of the scope of work and activities of the Task Force and an introduction to the proposed work plan template for the Task Force.
12:30-13:00		Agenda Item 4: Terms of Reference and Modus Operandi	Marco Barbieri, CMS	ETF1/Doc.2	The members will be invited to review the <i>modus operandi</i> of the Task Force and to make any proposals for amendment prior to their adoption.
1300 – 1430		Lunch break			

1430 – 1800	Plenary	Agenda Item 5: Case Studies	James Pearce Higgins, BTO Pepe Clarke, BirdLife Int. Stephanie Bätjer, RGI Mohammed El-Khayat, Egypt Osama El-Gebaly, Egypt Samantha Ralston, BirdLife South Africa Constant Hoogstad, EWT		Case study presentations will include legislation and policy, including strategic planning and impact assessments, and mitigation measures and cooperation in the energy industry followed by a discussion.
2030 – 2200		Pigalle Restaurant Dinner			
FRIDAY 2 Dec					
0900 – 1230	Plenary	Agenda Item 6: Implementation opportunities and challenges	Pepe Clarke, BirdLife Int.		Discussion on opportunities and challenges related to the implementation of relevant Resolutions and CMS Guidelines, including national legislation, strategic planning impact assessment and operational procedures, financial institutions and energy sector policy and practice.
		Agenda Item 7: Information exchange, technical assistance and capacity building	Pepe Clarke, BirdLife Int.	ETF1/Doc.5	Discussion on opportunities and priorities for cooperation on information exchange, technical assistance and capacity building.
1230 – 1430		Lunch break			
1430 – 1800	Plenary	Agenda Item 8: Input to Work Plan and discussion	Pepe Clarke, BirdLife Int.	ETF1/Doc.3 ETF1/Doc.4	Members will be invited to provide input to the work plan and provide suggestions for the future Energy Task Force activities and funding needs.
		Agenda Item 9: Task Force membership	Marco Barbieri, CMS Chair		Discussion on potential expansion of the Task Force membership.
		Agenda Item 10: Next meeting of the Task Force	Chair		Possible dates and venue for the2 <sup>nd</sup> Task Force meeting will be discussed, including any offer or expression of interest by members to host it.

Agenda Item 11: Any other business	Pepe Clarke, BirdLife Int. Chair	
Agenda Item 12: Closure of the meeting	Chair	The Chair will summarize the results of the meeting supported by the CMS Secretariat and the Coordinator.

Symbol	Agenda Item(s)	Title of Document		
Conference Papers	<u> </u>			
ETF1/Doc.1	2	Provisional Annotated Agenda and Meeting Schedule		
ETF1/Doc.2	5	Draft Modus Operandi for the Energy Task Force		
ETF1/Doc.3	3, 8	Draft Work Plan for the Energy Task Force		
ETF1/Doc.4	8	Draft Outreach and Promotion Plan for the Energy Task Force		
ETF1/Doc.5	7	Development of a communication platform for the Energy Task Force		
ETF1/Inf.1	3	Renewable Energy Technologies and Migratory Species: Guidelines for Sustainable Deployment		
ETF1/Inf.2	3	Guidelines on How to Avoid or Mitigate the Impact of Electricity Power Grids on Migratory Birds in the African-		
		Eurasian Region		
ETF1/Inf.3	3	CMS Resolution 11.27: Renewable Energy and Migratory Species		
ETF1/Inf.4	3	CMS Resolution 10.11: Power Lines and Migratory Birds		
ETF1/Inf.5	3	AEWA Resolution 5.11: Power Lines and Migratory Waterbirds		
ETF1/Inf.6	3	AEWA Resolution. 6.11: Addressing Impacts of Renewable Energy Deployment on Migratory Waterbirds		
ETF1/Inf.7	3	AEWA Resolution. 5.16: Renewable Energy and Migratory Waterbirds		
N/A	7	Energy Task Force website: www.cms.int/en/taskforce/energy-task-force		

#### **ANNEX II - Work Plan 2017-2018**

Theme <sup>1</sup>	Expected result	Actions	Responsible organisation(s) <sup>2</sup>	Timeline	Funding status <sup>3</sup>	Roll Out Action
Promoting implementation of relevant guidelines	Guidelines are integrated into decision-making.	Prepare and disseminate an information package for CMS and AEWA Parties, including fact sheets and information about existing decision support tools.	Coordinator, CMS and AEWA Secretariats, Israel	2017	Funded	Coordinator to develop first draft
		Prepare PowerPoint slides promoting the Energy Task Force and guidelines to use Task Force Members at relevant international events.	Coordinator, CMS Secretariat	2017	Funded	Coordinator to develop first draft
		Identify relevant stakeholders in energy and financial sectors.	Coordinator, CMS Secretariat	2017	Funded	Coordinator to invite relevant stakeholders.
		Prepare and disseminate an information package for <b>energy sector</b> stakeholders and environmental assessment practitioners, including fact sheets and information about existing decision support tools.	Coordinator, CMS Secretariat, BirdLife South Africa, Egypt	2017	Funded	Coordinator to develop first draft
		Prepare and disseminate an information package for <b>financial institutions</b> , including fact sheets and information about existing decision support tools.	Coordinator, CMS Secretariat, South Africa, EBRD	2017	Funded	Coordinator to develop first draft
		Prepare and disseminate an information package for conservation organisations, including fact sheets and information about existing decision support tools.	Coordinator, CMS Secretariat	2017	Funded	Coordinator to develop first draft
		Organise multi-stakeholder dialogue on renewable energy development and migratory species during CMS COP12.	Coordinator, CMS Secretariat, Task Force Members, Egypt, Germany	2017	Funded	Coordinator to initiate plan
		Prepare an information paper for CMS COP12 (Manila, October 2017) including	Coordinator, CMS Secretariat, Task	2017	Funded	Coordinator to develop first draft

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> These themes are based on the remit of the Energy Task Force, as described in the Terms of Reference (CMS Resolution 11.27 Annex 1).

<sup>2</sup> Organisations and agencies that have voluntarily committed to implementing the relevant action, with lead organisation in **bold text**.

<sup>3</sup> Funding status of the relevant action (e.g. in-kind contribution, funding confirmed, partially funded, not yet confirmed).

Theme <sup>1</sup>	Expected result	Actions	Responsible organisation(s) <sup>2</sup>	Timeline	Funding status <sup>3</sup>	Roll Out Action
		implementation analysis and global impact assessment (see below).	Force Members, Egypt, Germany			
		Side-event at UNFCCC COP23 (Bonn, November 2017)	Coordinator, CMS Secretariat, Task Force Members, Germany	2017	Funded	Coordinator to initiate plan
		Information document for energy and environmental sectors on the business case for implementing guidelines.	Power Africa, EWT, Egypt		In kind	Member initiative
		Engage with industry and investors - build partnerships and establish pilot initiatives with industry and investors.	Coordinator, CMS Secretariat, Task Force Members		Unfunded /In kind	Coordinator to continue engagement
		Translate key information into other languages (as required).	Coordinator, CMS Secretariat		Unfunded	To be determined
Priority setting	Work plan reflects priorities.	Review work plan at 2 <sup>nd</sup> Energy Task Force meeting to identify additional priority activities in line with CMS Resolution 11.27 and including long term goals.	Task Force Members	2017	In kind	Coordinator to initiate review
		Establish technical working group for renewable energy and powerlines.	Israel, Coordinator, BirdLife South Africa, EWT	2017	In kind	Coordinator to establish Technical WG
Mobilising resources	Priority activities identified and funded.	Identify key funding priorities and opportunities.	Coordinator, CMS Secretariat, Task Force Members	2017	In kind	Member initiative
		Prepare fundraising concept note(s), with input from Energy Task Force members	Coordinator, CMS Secretariat	2017	Funded	Coordinator to prepare draft
		Prepare funding proposal to further develop decision support tools	BirdLife International, Task Force Members	2018	In kind	Member initiative
		Liaise with potential donors to seek support for Energy Task Force activities	CMS Secretariat, Coordinator, Task Force Members	2017-2018	Funded (2017)	Member initiative

Theme <sup>1</sup>	Expected result	Actions	Responsible organisation(s) <sup>2</sup>	Timeline	Funding status <sup>3</sup>	Roll Out Action
Monitoring implementation and impediments to	Report on status of implementation;	Conduct an analysis of <b>2014</b> CMS national reports to assess implementation of relevant resolutions.	Coordinator, CMS Secretariat	2017	Funded	Coordinator to develop draft
implementation	Impediments to implementation and potential	Conduct an analysis of <b>2017</b> CMS national reports to assess implementation of relevant resolutions.	Coordinator, CMS Secretariat	2017	Funded	Coordinator to develop draft
	solutions identified.	Document implementation barriers and potential solutions identified during the 1 <sup>st</sup> Energy Task Force meeting.	Coordinator	2017	Funded	Coordinator to develop draft
		Interview selected CMS Parties and relevant stakeholders to identify key impediments to implementation.	Coordinator	2017	Funded	Coordinator to develop draft
		Incorporate implementation analysis into information paper for CMS COP12 (above).	Coordinator, CMS Secretariat	2017	Funded	Coordinator to develop draft
		Analyse existing guidelines to identify gaps and need for more technical detail; develop complementary technical notes (e.g. sensitivity mapping, thresholds, data collection and monitoring, mitigation hierarchy and powerlines).	Technical working group.	2017	Un- funded/ In-kind	Member initiative
Stimulating communication and information	Task force members collaborate and	Make information about the ETF available via dedicated web space on CMS website.	Coordinator, CMS Secretariat	2017-2018	In-kind	Coordinator to develop content; CMS Secretariat upload
exchange	share information.	Energy Task Force members exchange case studies, lessons learnt and best practices during task force meetings.	Task Force Members	2016-2018	In-kind	Member initiative
		Create online discussion platform to facilitate collaboration between Energy Task Force members.	CMS Secretariat	2017-2018	In-kind	CMS Secretariat
		Task force members use online platform to share information and resources, and plan collaborative activities.	Coordinator, Task Force Members,	2017-2018	Funded (2017 only)	Member initiative
		Deliver and record webinar series for CMS Parties, financial institutions and energy sector stakeholders, with presentations by	Coordinator, Task Force Members, EBRD	2017-2018	Un- funded/In kind	To be determined

Theme <sup>1</sup>	Expected result	Actions	Responsible organisation(s) <sup>2</sup>	Timeline	Funding status <sup>3</sup>	Roll Out Action
		Energy Task Force members and other experts.				
		Identify relevant Best Practices in relation to powerline impacts that could be applicable in other countries. Disseminate guidelines.	RGI (Europe), EWT, Egypt, Task Force Members	2017	Un- funded/In kind	Member initiative
		Survey Task Force Members and collate available resources and lessons learned with regards to planning, impact assessment and mitigation.	Technical Working Group	2017		Member initiative
Strengthening regional and international networks	Strong regional and international networks	Task Force members to promote the aims of the Task Force through relevant regional and international networks.	Task Force Members	2017-2018	In-kind	Member initiative
Stimulating research	Significantly increase the	Identify research gaps and priorities.	Technical Working Group	2017	Unfunded	Member initiative
	evidence base on which to make planning and mitigation decisions.	Complete a global assessment of predicted impacts of large-scale renewable energy deployment on birds and mammals. <sup>4</sup>	British Trust for Ornithology, BirdLife International, IUCN, RSPB, University of Cambridge, EWT	2016-2017	Funded (Follow-up to current project requires funding)	Coordinator to setup introductions and working group input
		Assessment of potential effectiveness of management to mitigate negative impacts of renewable energy upon biodiversity	British Trust for Ornithology, and others, Egypt. Israel	2017-2018	Funding required	To be determined
		Encourage further assessments of the potential conflicts between different renewable energy sectors and grid infrastructure at a regional and/or national scale to improve the understanding of the impacts on biodiversity, the effectiveness of mitigation measures, and to explore innovative solutions.	Task Force Members, EWT	2017-2018	Funding required	Member initiative

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Outputs from the research will include: report and paper on species' sensitivity to renewable energy generation; species assessments incorporated within the Species Information Service, co-managed by IUCN and BirdLife International; hotspot maps of vulnerability to renewable energy generation; report and paper summarising global vulnerability assessment results; and, policy-focused summaries for online dissemination.



# **Convention on the Conservation of Migratory Species of Wild Animals**



#### **ANNEX III - Cape Town Declaration**

## Cape Town Declaration on reconciling renewable energy and power line development with migratory species conservation

Cape Town, South Africa, 1-2 December 2016

We, the members of the *Multistakeholder Task Force on Reconciling Selected Energy Sector Developments with Migratory Species Conservation* ('Energy Task Force'), established by Resolution 11.27 of the Convention on Migratory Species,<sup>i</sup> which met for the first time in Cape Town. South Africa from 1-2 December 2016:

*Welcome* the entry into force of the Paris Agreement on 4 November 2016, and *note* the importance of rapid deployment of renewable energy technologies as a key response to the urgent threat of climate change;

Recognise that the deployment of renewable energy and associated infrastructure such as power lines may result in negative environmental impacts, including impacts on migratory species and their habitats:

Conscious that the risk to migratory species can be particularly significant if renewable energy installations and power lines are placed in inappropriate locations and without integrating environmental considerations in planning and assessment procedures;

*Note* that effective integration of wildlife conservation into energy policy and decision making can contribute to public acceptance of renewable energy development and reduce the potential for conflict, delay and associated financial costs;

Recognise the importance of constructive engagement between government, private sector and civil society organisations, and note the value of international cooperation and exchange in ensuring the conservation of migratory species across borders;

*Mindful* of existing decisions<sup>ii,iii</sup> and guidance<sup>iv</sup> in relation to the reconciliation of renewable energy and power line development with migratory species conservation;

Call on policy makers and regulators to develop, implement and evaluate strategic environmental assessment and strategic planning processes to minimise environmental impacts, reduce social conflict and facilitate responsible energy development;

*Encourage* the energy sector, regulators and financial institutions to utilise decision support tools and demonstrated best practices to avoid, mitigate and monitor impacts on migratory species and their habitats, including cumulative impacts;

*Commit* to a collaborative program of work to promote responsible renewable energy and power line development, including:

- preparing and disseminating tailored information resources for the energy sector, policy makers, regulators, financial institutions and conservation organisations;
- promoting research into the current and predicted impacts of renewable energy and power line

development on migratory species, the effectiveness of avoidance and mitigation measures, and related economic costs and benefits:

 facilitating collaborative engagement between key stakeholders, focused on identifying and implementing practical, evidence-based strategies for reducing the impacts of energy development on migratory species;

Extend our warm thanks to the Government of South Africa for its hospitality and to the Government of Germany for generously sponsoring the establishment of the task force.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Convention on Migratory Species (CMS) Resolution 11.17 *Renewable Energy and Migratory Species*.

Relevant decisions in relation to reconciling renewable energy development with migratory species conservation include: CMS Resolution 7.5 Wind Turbines and Migratory Species; CMS Resolution 10.19 Migratory Species Conservation in the Light of Climate Change; CMS Resolution 10.24 Further Steps to Abate Underwater Noise Pollution for the Protection of Cetaceans and Other Migratory Species; CMS Resolution 11.27 Renewable Energy and Migratory Species; AEWA Resolution 5.16 Renewable Energy and Migratory Waterbirds; EUROBATS Resolution 7.5 Wind Turbines and Bat Populations; Ramsar Resolution XI.10 Guidance for Addressing the Implications for Wetlands of Policies, Plans and Activities in the Energy Sector; ASCOBANS Resolution 6.2 Adverse Effects of Underwater Noise on Marine Mammals during Offshore Construction Activities for Renewable Energy Production; ACCOBAMS Resolution 4.17 Guidelines to Address the Impact of Anthropogenic Noise on Cetaceans in the ACCOBAMS Area; Bern Convention Rec. 109 on minimizing adverse effects of wind power generation on wildlife.

Relevant decisions in relation to mitigating the impacts of power line development on birds include: CMS Resolution 10.11 *Power Lines and Migratory Birds*; AEWA Resolution 5.11 *Power Lines and Migratory Waterbirds*; Bern Convention Recommendation No. 110 on minimizing adverse effects of power lines on birds.

This guidance includes, *inter alia*: "Guidelines on How to Avoid or Mitigate the Impact of Electricity Power Grids on Migratory Birds in the African-Eurasian Region", adopted by CMS COP10, AEWA MOP5 and CMS Raptors MOU MOS1; 'Renewable Energy Technologies and Migratory Species: Guidelines for Sustainable Deployment', adopted by CMS COP11 and AEWA MOP6; and "Guidelines for consideration of bats in wind farm projects", EUROBATS Publication Series No. 6.

Year Example, the Renewable Grid Initiative database of best practices: http://renewables-grid.eu/activities/best-practices.html

#### **ANNEX IV – List of Participants**

#### **MEMBERS**

#### Governments

#### **Egypt**

Mr. Osama Ahmed Moustafa El-Gebaly Project Manager of Mainstreaming Conservation of Migratory Soaring Birds (MSB) Ministry of Environment

Dr. Mohamed Al-Khayat

Vice Chairman for Studies, Research, and Technical Affairs, Chair of Renewable Energy and Energy efficiency of Arab Experts Committee, League of Arab States, LAS., New & Renewable Energy Authority (NREA)

#### Germany

Dr. Jürgen Friedrich, LL.M.

Federal Ministry for the Environment, Nature Conservation, Building and Nuclear Safety (BMUB)

#### Ghana

Mr. Nana Kofi Adu-Nsiah Executive Director Wildlife Division of Forestry Commission

#### Israel

Dr. Noam Leader Head of Ecology Department, Science Division, Israel Nature & Parks Authority

#### Kenva

Mr. Stephen M. Manegene Director, Wildlife Conservation, Ministry of Environment and Natural Resources

#### South Africa

Ms. Wilma Lutsch

Director: Biodiversity Conservation Department of Environmental Affairs

Mr. Constant Hoogstad

Advisor to Ms Wilma Lutsch in the Task Force

Programme Manager – Wildlife & Energy Programme and Wildlife & Roads Programme Endangered Wildlife Trust

#### **Government Agencies**

#### Power Africa - United States Agency for International Development (USAID)

United States

Mr. Benjamin Skolnik

**Environment Foreign Service Officer** 

#### **Institutions and Organisations**

#### **BirdLife International**

Pepe Clarke Global Head of Policy

Aida Kowalska Safeguard Policy Officer – ETF Coordinator

#### **CMS Secretariat**

Mr. Marco Barbieri Scientific Adviser

#### **Remote Participation**

#### **European Bank of Reconstruction and Development**

Mr. Robert Adamczyk Senior Environmental Advisor/Lead Sector Advisor Power and Heavy Industry

#### **Renewables Grid Initiative**

Ms. Stephanie Bätjer Project Manager

### **OBSERVERS**

#### <u>Institutions and Organisations</u>

#### **BirdLife South Africa**

Samantha Ralston-Paton Renewable Energy Manager

Seugnet Terblanche Assistant

#### Remote Participation

#### The British Trust for Ornithology

Dr. James Pearce Higgins Director of Science